11

FILE NO. 90-96-2

2

3

.

-6

7

23

24

25

ORDINANCE NO. 195-

(Landmarks) 1 DESIGNATING THE MILO HOADLEY RESIDENCE AS LANDMARK NO. 216 PURSUANT TO ARTICLE 10 OF THE CITY PLANNING CODE.

Be it ordained by the People of the City and County of San 5 Francisco:

Section 1. The Board of Supervisors hereby finds that the A Hoadley Residence, located at 2908-2910 Bush Street, Lot 13 in 9 Assessor's Block 1046, has a special character and special 10 historical, architectural and aesthetic interest and value, and 11 that its designation as a Landmark will further the purposes of, 12 and conform to the standards set forth in Article 10 of the City 13 Planning Code. 14

Pursuant to Section 1004 of the City Designation: (a) 15 Planning Code, Chapter II, Part II of the San Francisco Municipal 16 Code, the Hoadley Residence is hereby designated as Landmark No. 17 216. This designation having been fully approved by Resolution No. 18 \_\_\_\_ of the City Planning Commission, which Resolution 14079 19 is on file with the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors under File 20 90-96-2 and is incorporated herein and made a part of No. 21 hereof as though fully set forth. 22

(b) <u>Required Data</u>:

(1) The description of the location and boundaries of the Landmark site is the Milo Hoadley Residence located at

Page 1

BOARD OF SUPERVISORS

95.649L

2908-2910 Bush Street, being Lot 13 within Assessor's Block 1046.

- (2) The characteristics of the Landmark which justify its designation are described and shown in the photographs and other materials on file in the Planning Department Docket No. 95.649L and the Landmarks Preservation Advisory Board's Case Report contained in Docket No. 95.649L.
- (3) The particular features that should be preserved are those shown in the photographs on file in Planning Department Docket No. 95.649L and described in the Landmarks Preservation Advisory Board's Case Report, in Section A, entitled "Architecture," Subsection No. 5, "Design" and in Section D, "Integrity," said photographs and Case Report are incorporated in this designating ordinance as though fully set forth.

Page 2

APPROVED AS TO FORM: LOUISE H. RENNE

1

2

3

Ā

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

25

CITY PLANNING COMMISSION

RECOMMENDED:

CITY ATTORNEY 21 22 23 Deputy City Attorney -24

Lu Blazej

Director of Planning

G002199

BOARD OF SUPERVISORS

95.649L



# LANDMARKS PRESERVATION ADVISORY BOARD

1660 MISSION STREET, 5TH FLOOR, SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94103 TEL. (415) 558-6345 • FAX. (415) 558-6426



HISTORIC BUILDING NAME: Milo Hoadley Residence OWNER: James and John Hayes

ADDRESS: 2908-2910 Bush Street	BLOCK & LOT: 1046/13
POPULAR BUILDING NAME: None	ZONING: RH-2
<b>ORIGINAL USE:</b> Single family residence	ARCHITECT: Unknown
CURRENT USE: Two-unit residence	CONSTRUCTION DATE: [1] 1854-1858
STYLE: [50-350] Italianate	LANDMARK NO: 216 LPAB VOTE: 4-1
NUMBER OF STORIES: 2 1/2	EXTERIOR MATERIALS: wood and glass

STATEMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE: The Hoadley residence is one of the oldest houses in San Francisco and was built as the home of Milo Hoadley, a civil engineer who surveyed much of San Francisco during the 1850s and 1860s. Hoadley also owned a large portion of the Western Addition and Pacific Heights, commonly known as the Hoadley tract; subsequent land titles there derive from Hoadley's ownership, and this house was built inside the tract near its western boundary. Milo Hoadley was born in Connecticut in 1809 and came to California 1849. In that year he was appointed to be Deputy Surveyor of San Francisco under William Eddy, and in 1853 or 1854 he became the City Engineer. In May 1854, Hoadley recommended a system of street grades which would have resulted in the leveling of Telegraph Hill, Russian Hill, and Nob Hill, and the use of material from these hills to create a breakwater north into the bay. Opposition to these "Hoadley Grades" resulted in the defeat of this plan. Hoadley was more successful in private practice. His work for major landowners resulted in his surveys of Hayes Valley, the Beideman Tract, and much of Bernal Heights. In about 1870 Hoadley proposed creating a major reservoir in San Mateo County; this was later done as Crystal Springs Reservoir. In 1854 Hoadley purchased a 160 acre tract bounded roughly by Geary, Jackson, Divisadero, and Presidio Boulevard. At some time during the next four years he built a home for his family, the current 2908-2910 Bush Street, near the western boundary of this tract. In 1862, as the growth of the city made its subdivision feasible, Hoadley surveyed the "Hoadley tract" and divided it into blocks and lots; it was formally known as "Hoadley's Extension of the Western Addition." Hoadley lived here until his death in 1887, and his family lived here until 1900. The house is among the earliest surviving example of the type and style which was most commonly used for find residences during the 1850s and 1860s. The type is characterized by a rectangular plan, a covered porch, and Italianate detailing, including quoins at the corners and brackets at the cornice line. These fine houses were often surrounded by gardens. In sum, these houses were some of the most restrained and spacious examples of the Italianate style ever built in San Francisco. The Hoadley Residence retains these essential characteristics, and recalls the period when low population density permitted generous proportions for houses and gardened lots.

FINAL CASE REPORT

DATE: November 15, 1995 Page 2

## **CRITERIA**

ARCHITECTURE

1. STYLE: Significance as an Example of a Particular Architectural Style or Convention

## 2. CONSTRUCTION TYPE/ USE CATEGORY:

Significance as an Example of a Particular Occupancy Type or Use, Method of Construction or Material

#### 3. DATE BUILT:

Significance as an Example of a Particular Period in San Francisco History

#### 4. ARCHITECT:

Designed or Built by an Architect or Builder Who Has made a Significant Contribution to the Community, State or Nation

#### 5. DESIGN:

Quality of Composition, Detailing and Ornament Measured in Part In Originality, Urban Design, Craftsmanship or Uniqueness The Milo Hoadley house represents an example of the Italianate style of architecture in San Francisco. The corner quoins, bracketed cornice, and window shelf moldings are typical of numerous Italianate houses in San Francisco today. The generous width of the house, the square form, and the covered porch supported by square posts are hallmarks of the 1850s and 1860s, when Italianate houses with these features were built here in large numbers. Today, this house and the Sylvester mansion in the Bayview district (City Landmark #61) are among the last surviving examples of the Italianate style built in this form. (VG).

Wood frame row houses from the Victorian era remain quite common in San Francisco but detached houses with covered porches are quite rare. Besides the Milo Hoadley house, the Abner Phelps house of ca. 1851 (City Landmark #32) and the David Robinson house of 1854 (in the Telegraph Hill Historic District) are other early examples. Although the latter two houses have Gothic detailing, they, like the Hoadley house, are detached houses with covered porches and are rare survivors of this type. (E)

Milo Hoadley purchased his 160 acre tract from the proprietors of the adjacent Lone Mountain Cemetery in July 1854, and probably built this house soon afterward. He and his family certainly lived here by 1858. The house is very similar to other fine Italianate houses of the 1850s which were built on Rincon Hill, Russian Hill, and to a lesser extent Nob Hill in the 1850s. Most of these have vanished, leaving the Hoadley house as one of the few surviving residences in San Francisco from that decade. (E)

The architect and builder of this house are unknown. (F/P)

This Italianate house is symmetrically designed, with generous proportions. The cornice is bracketed in the manner typical of San Francisco Italianate houses, with rectangular panels between each bracket. The second story windows are paired and symmetrically spaced, and topped by flat shelf moldings. Classical quoins line the corners of the house, and the porch, with turned balusters and square posts, runs the entire width. The careful

FINAL CASE REPORT

DATE: November 15, 1995 Page 3

6. INTERIOR:

Interior Arrangement, Finish, Craftsmanship, and/or Use Detail is/are Particularly Attractive or Unique

# **B. HISTORIC CONTEXT**

### 7. PERSONS:

Associated with the Life or Activities of a Person, Group or Institution That Has Made a Significant Contribution to the Community, State or Nation

#### 8. EVENTS:

Associated with Events That Have Made a Significant Contribution to the Community, State or Nation

#### 9. PATTERNS:

Associated with or Illustrative of Broad Patterns of City's Cultural, Social, Political or Economic History or Development

# C. PHYSICAL CONTEXT

10. CONTINUITY:

Contributes to the Continuity or Character of the Street Neighborhood or Area composition and fine detailing of this house make it a fine example of its type, as well as a rare one. (VG)

The interior of this house was not visited for this report. (F/P)

Milo Hoadley (1809-1887) was one of those engineers and surveyors who helped to shape the appearance of San Francisco, and he was well known as an important member of the city government in his own time. As Deputy Surveyor during 1849-1853, he assisted the often drunk City Surveyor, William Eddy, in the performance of his duties, at a time when the city's boundaries were being extended. As the City Engineer, in 1854, Hoadley proposed the leveling of Telegraph, Russian, and Nob hills to promote commerce, a plan which was defeated. During the 1850s and 1860s Hoadley also worked as a private surveyor, surveying Hayes Valley, the Beidman Tract, and much of Bernal Heights for major landowners. In 1862 he also surveyed his own 160 acre tract, "Hoadley's Extension of the Western Addition" (bounded by Geary, Jackson, Divisadero, and Presidio Boulevard. (VG)

In April 1877 a surprise party was given for Milo and Sarah Hoadley at this house on the occasion of their 46th wedding anniversary. The Alta California newspaper listed all of the friends and relatives who were present and described the location of the house as being "away out near the Necropolis," that is, by Lone Mountain Cemetery. (G)

San Francisco's Western Addition was largely developed with rowhouses during the 1870s-1890s. Previous to 1870, however, a few scattered houses were built far beyond the leading edge of rowhouse development, in the Western Addition and beyond. As the 19th century progressed, Victorian-era tract developments grew up around these early houses. The Hoadley house is a good example of an 1850s house which once stood alone and is now surrounded by houses from the 1870s and later. (VG)

The 2900 block of Bush Street consists of thirteen Victorian style houses; and three buildings from the 1960s or later. All of the Victorian houses are architecturally intact. The Hoadley house relates best to these other Victorians, which are located adjacent to it on the east and directly across the street. Next door to the Hoadley house on the west is a detached craftsman style cottage

#### FINAL CASE REPORT

DATE: November 15, 1995 Page 4

11. SETTING:

Setting and/or Landscape Contributes to the Continuity or Character of the Street, Neighborhood or Area

12. VISUAL SIGNIFICANCE: Significant as a Visual Landmark to the Neighborhood,

City, Region or Nation as a Whole

## **D. INTEGRITY**

13. ALTERATIONS:

The Degree to Which the Property Has Retained Original Materials From Which its Significance is Derived or Which Characterize its Period (2950 Bush), and next to this is a recently built, four story set of townhouses, 2954-2960 Bush, which looms over the craftsman cottage and the Hoadley residence. (G)

The Hoadley house is set back on its lot about 30' from the sidewalk, and is separated from adjacent buildings on the east and west by about 20'. It is the only building on the block which is set back from the street in such a manner and which is separated from its neighbors by more than a few feet. This open space helps to preserve the feeling that this house was built well in advance of the era of rowhouse development in the Western Addition. A concrete retaining wall, scored to resemble masonry, runs the width of this property and the adjacent lot at 2950 Bush Street. (VG)

This house stands out as one of the few in the neighborhood which was built on a large lot rather than in a pattern of rowhouse development. Stylistically, it is readily apparent that this house is one of the oldest, in the Western Addition, between Geary Boulevard and the Bay of San Francisco. (G)

From a lithographic image of the neighborhood drawn between 1854-1867, and which shows this house, it is apparent that the Hoadley house is mostly intact as built. The roofline has been changed since then; that is, the hipped roof with dormer window was probably added in the early 20th century. Additionally, the balcony once extended around the corner along the east side of the house. Otherwise, the Hoadley residence as excellent integrity as a fine Italianate house of the 1850s. (VG)

E. THREATS TO SITE: NONE () DEVELOPMENT () ZONING (X) VANDALISM () PUBLIC WORKS PROJECT () OTHER ()

**CALIFORNIA STATE REGISTER: HERE TODAY:** DCP 1976 SURVEY: (Y) **OTHER: REPRESENTATION IN EXISTING SURVEYS:** () NATIONAL () STATE (X) LOCAL EDITED BY LANDMARKS BOARD STAFF **BASED UPON MATERIAL SUPPLIED BY:** NAME: William Kostura ADDRESS: 140 Lenox Way San Francisco, CA 94127 **TELEPHONE:** (415) 681-8652 DATE SUBMITTED: October 2, 1995



FINAL CASE REPORT

DATE: November 15, 1995 Page 5

# BIBLIOGRAPHY

Bloomfield, Anne, "Great Old Houses #100," The New Fillmore, July 1994, p. 22.

Hoadley, Milo, Papers. Bancroft Library.

Hoadley, Milo, "The City Engineer's Communication to the Common Council of San Francisco, in Relation to Street Grades," May 22, 1854. In Pamphlets on San Francisco Lands, Bancroft Library. See also "Report of the Board of Engineers Upon the City Grades" in the same collection of pamphlets.

Map Book 1, p. 96, Hoadley's Extension of the Western Addition, recorded May 9, 1862. At the Recorder's Office, City Hall.

Sanborn Insurance Map, 1893.

San Francisco Call, May 21, 1887, p. 7 Death of Milo Hoadley.

San Francisco City Directories, 1850-1900.

VFM:LPABCASE\mj:2908LPAB.Cas



2908-10 Bush Built between 1854 and 1858 First owner: Milo Hoadley, engineer and surveyor

Hoadley purchased or claimed a vast tract bounded by Geary, Jackson, Divisadero and Presidio Blvd. All property in this area derives from Hoadley's ownership. Board of Supervisors, San Francisco S.

S

S

Passed for Second Reading May 13, 1996

Absent: Supervisor Leal

S S Ayes: Supervisors Alioto Ammiano S Bierman Hsieh Kaufman Kennedy S Shelley Teng Yaki 5

Ayes: Supervisors Alioto Ammiano Bierman Kaufman Shelley Teng Yaki

Absent: Supervisors Hsieh Kennedy S S Leal

I hereby certify that the foregoing ordinance was finally passed by the Board of Supervisors of the City and County of San Francisco

Finally Passed

May 20, 1996

File No. 90-96-2

all 82 Chin erk Mayor

Date Approved

MAY 2 2 1996

٩,

File No. 95.649L Milo Hoadley Residence 2908-2910 Bush Street Lot 13 in Assessor's Block 1046

# SAN FRANCISCO

# CITY PLANNING COMMISSION

# **RESOLUTION NO. 14079**

WHEREAS, A proposal to designate the Milo Hoadley Residence located at 2908-2910 Bush Street, being Lot 13 in Assessor's Block 1046, as Landmark No. 216 pursuant to the provisions of Article 10 of the City Planning Code; and

WHEREAS, The Landmarks Board finalized a Case Report on the subject property, considered public testimony on said Case Report and recommended an intent to initiate the Milo Hoadley Residence as Landmark No. 216 at its Regular Meeting of November 15, 1995; and

WHEREAS, The City Planning Commission, after due notice given held a Public Hearing on February 15, 1996 to consider the proposed designation and the Final Case Report of said Landmarks Board; and

WHEREAS, This City Planning Commission believes that the proposed Landmark has a special character and special historical, architectural and aesthetic interest and value; and that the proposed designation would be in furtherance of and in conformance with the purposes and standards of the said Article 10;

WHEREAS, On February 22, 1996, the City Planning Commission rescinded their action of February 15, 1996 to approve the request for Landmark designation and continued the item to the Regular Meeting of March 14, 1996 to consider new evidence about the Landmark nomination to be provided by the Project Sponsor; and

WHEREAS, On March 14, 1996, the City Planning Commission held a second public hearing on the Landmark nomination to consider the new evidence in oral testimony submitted by the Project Sponsor and concluded that there was insufficient new evidence to deny the designation and therefore recommended approval of the Milo Hoadley Residence at 2908-2910 Bush Street as a Landmark;

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED, First, That this City Planning Commission does hereby recommend APPROVAL of the designation of the Milo Hoadley Residence located at 2908-2910 Bush Street, Lot 13 within Assessor's Block 1046;

File No. 95.649L Milo Hoadley Residence 2908-2910 Bush Street Lot 13 in Assessor's Block 1046 Resolution No. 14079 Page 2

Second, That the special character and special historical, architectural and aesthetic interest and value of the Landmark is set forth in the photographs and other materials on file in Planning Docket No. 95.649L which is incorporated herein and made a part thereof as though fully set forth;

Third, That the particular features that should be preserved are those shown in the photographs on file in Planning Department Docket No. 95.649L and described in the Landmarks Preservation Advisory Board's Case Report, in Section A, entitled "Architecture," Subsection No. 5, "Design" and in Section D "Integrity," said photographs and Case Report are incorporated in this designating ordinance as though fully set forth.

AND BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, That the City Planning Commission hereby directs its Secretary to transmit the proposal for designation, with a copy of this Resolution to the Board of Supervisors for appropriate action.

I hereby certify that the foregoing Motion was ADOPTED by the City Planning Commission on March 14, 1996.

Linda Avery Commission Secretary

AYES: Commissioners Chinchilla, Hayden, Marks, and Mills

NOES: Commissioner Lowenberg

ABSENT: Commissioner Levine

EXCUSED: Commissioner Martin

ADOPTED: March 14, 1996

VFM\Resoluti\mj:CPC2908.Res